**Dyslexia in the learning of the law**

Jackie Lane, University of Huddersfield

**DISLECKSIA**

*A bifrent wai ov lerning*

**Abstract**

Dyslexia in the learning of the law is considered here, including its meaning and its impact on the student and teacher. Dyslexia is probably the most common ‘disability’ encountered in the law classroom and yet most law lecturers have only a vague understanding of what it means, or of the impact it has on the student’s ability to study law. This paper aims to give tutors a better understanding of the condition, and to help them to an awareness of the legal obligations owed towards students disabled in this way. It will give guidance on how they can recognise a potentially dyslexic student, and how to assist the student to overcome their difficulties, thus ensuring greater equality between the dyslexic and the non-dyslexic students. It draws on a wide variety of texts and papers, published statistics, and on the qualitative analysis of a semi-structured interview with a law graduate who has this ‘different learning ability’.

**What is dyslexia?**

Dyslexia is one of a range of specific learning differences which includes dyscalculia, dyspraxia, attention deficit disorder, attention deficit and hyperactivity disorder, and autistic spectrum disorders.

Such learning differences are not part of a condition that children grow out of, but as they grow they may develop coping strategies, demonstrating that they are not an insurmountable barrier to success in one’s life.

“It is characterised by difficulties with phonological processing, rapid naming, working memory, processing speed, and the automatic development of skills that may not match up to an individual’s other cognitive abilities.”[[1]](#footnote-1)

Dyslexia is not easily defined and there have been many attempts to do so. The British Dyslexia Association gives this definition:

“Dyslexia is a specific learning difficulty which mainly affects the development of literacy and language related skills.

It is likely to be present at birth and to be life-long in its effects. It tends to be resistant to conventional teaching methods, but its effects can be mitigated by appropriately specific

intervention, including the application of information technology and supportive counselling.”[[2]](#footnote-2) There are many intervention programmes in schools, but these are generally not available in Universities where students must rely on technology and counselling.

However, it is more useful to focus on the underlying cognitive processes and describe the strengths and weaknesses of those with diagnosed dyslexia:

*Possible weaknesses*

* Late readers, but usually successful eventually
* Weak at memory span tasks such as recalling series of numbers presented aurally
* Difficulty with mental arithmetic
* Difficulty with learning sequences such as months of the year
* Slow in learning material presented exclusively in verbal or written form
* Poor at spelling
* Poor organisation of time management

*Possible strengths:*

* Innovative thinkers
* Excellent trouble shooters
* Intuitive problem solving
* Creative in many different ways
* Lateral thinkers[[3]](#footnote-3)

Although usually termed a disability, in view of the academic and professional success achieved by many dyslexics, it is perhaps better viewed as a different way of learning. What we, as tutors, need to do is recognise how dyslexics learn and then cater for those learning needs. The research identifies that dyslexics have a reduced capacity for dealing with and storing phonological information – they have inefficient working memories. Dyslexia is not simply a problem with reading, writing and spelling. Difficulties can be primary and secondary. The former are as a result of poor working memory and this can present problems to students trying to follow what is said in a lecture. Secondary difficulties can be emotional and social and may present as poor social skills and inability to understand body language and other non-verbal behaviour. Adults who arrive at University may have no idea that they are dyslexic and may suffer low self-esteem and frustration. An early diagnosis can help to address many of these problems and a tutor’s basic awareness of dyslexia could be the first step on the road to receiving support and help for that student.

**How to identify the dyslexic student**

The first thing a tutor may notice is the apparent discrepancy between a student’s general ability and their literacy skills. Any student who has good verbal skills but has obvious difficulty with reading and writing may give cause to make further enquiries. Some common characteristics to watch out for are:

* A discrepancy between academic achievement and performance in practical problem-solving and/ or verbal skills
* Excessive misspelling in written work, including errors such as confusion of letter order
* Difficulty with sequencing tasks that are usually automatic, such as reciting the months of the year and arithmetic tables
* Problems with organising work
* An aversion to writing notes or excessive note-taking
* Reluctance to write anything at all
* Evidence of difficulty with working memory tasks
* Forgetting series of instructions
* A tendency to talk rather than listen as a strategy for restricting the input of information[[4]](#footnote-4)

Taken singly none of these may give cause for concern but if a student displays a cluster of such symptoms, this may require further investigation. A personal tutorial may provide an informal opportunity for information gathering. Then, if it appears possible that the student may indeed have dyslexia, he or she should be referred to a qualified educational psychologist who can carry out in-depth information gathering and appropriate testing and diagnosis. Following this, recommendations can be made to support the student’s learning, with the cooperation and support of the tutor. Thus, the tutor plays a very important role both and the beginning and later on in the process of supporting the dyslexic student.

**Strategies for improving and supporting learning**

Learning is enhanced when it involves seeing, hearing and doing. The learning process is improved if information is presented in a variety of ways – this is called *multisensory learning*. This maximises learning by using all available routes to the brain.

In the law lecture, or even in the tutorial, the vast majority of learning is not multi-sensory. Learning is based very largely on listening and reading; doing and seeing are used only rarely as teaching methods. These traditional approaches to learning are ill-suited to the dyslexic student.[[5]](#footnote-5)

Dyslexics have poor working memories and so need to learn in ways that compensate for this. Three basic principles can be adopted to enable a dyslexic to become more efficient. Learning should be:

* Manageable
* Multisensory
* Make use of memory aids

The three Ms![[6]](#footnote-6)

**Making it manageable**

By breaking information to be learned or tasks to be carried out into smaller chunks, the task can be made more manageable. Even a non-dyslexic will usually break up a phone number into groups of three or four digits.

**Making it multi-sensory**

There is more than one pathway to the memory – the more senses one uses, the more effective the message is at reaching the brain. Seeing and listening to information on the television is more effective than hearing the same information on the radio because it is multi-sensory.

**Making use of memory aids**

Mnemonics can help with the recall of lists and visual imagery can be very helpful. For example, visualising a shopping list as a series of items in a familiar room is much more effective than trying to memorise a written list.

**Using technology**

Technology can be used to enhance accessibility and inclusion – such use need not require expert knowledge of technology and would therefore, in most cases, amount to a ‘reasonable adjustment’. This adjustment could be in response to an identified need from a dyslexic student, a change to the way in which delivery is made in general, or offered as an alternative to other learning routes.

Since law tutors may not necessarily be aware of what works best for a particular student, it makes sense to offer a range of resources that can be accessed by students with a wide range of abilities and disabilities rather than trying to tailor resources to meet a specific need, unless this needs to be negotiated with the dyslexic student personally, as the range of difficulties can be very wide and diverse.

However, Simon Ball and Helen James offer some everyday adaptations that we can make to our teaching and learning materials.[[7]](#footnote-7)

* Ensure that resources make their purpose clear
* Clarity of layout and structure is helpful
* Provide materials well in advance (a VLE is valuable here)
* Do not use black on white; a light coloured background is preferable. Each user may have specific preferences – the BDA website allows users to choose colours to suit their own personal preference.
* Although many dyslexics prefer a sans serif font,more students would be satisfied by using an Ariel font with an adequate font size. Again, if materials are made available electronically in advance, students may choose their own personal preference (N.B. do not mark materials ‘Read only’ )
* Do not justify text – this creates uneven spaces between letters and words that dyslexic students find difficult.
* Do not *italicise text* or USE CAPITAL LETTERS INAPPROPRIATELY - this makes text much harder to read.
* Although increasing the amount of time given to dyslexic students when sitting exams, it may be possible to design assessment that does not require reading and writing within a set time. Although the Joint Academic Stage Board does require the Foundations of Legal Knowledge to be examined by at least 50%, the guidance does not specify that this has to be entirely time constrained. Bell and James offer some alternatives that could be offered to some students such as an oral examination or a take-away paper that needs to be completed within a given time e.g. a day, week or even term.
* Concentrating for long periods can be a problem so using shorter periods of study and employing active learning methods can make learning more effective
* Consider using podcasts and vodcasts for feedback on assignments
* Give dyslexic students a list of references for use in an assignment as they have problems finding their way around a library

**The legal obligation on education providers**

As lawyers, we are only too well aware that we are under a *legal* as well as a moral obligation to make reasonable adjustments for disabled learners. The Equality Act 2010 has made some changes, including the introduction of a new head of discrimination specific to disability – *discrimination arising from* disability. The Equality Human Rights Commission has issued some useful guidance[[8]](#footnote-8). This clarifies that “discrimination arising from disability occurs when you treat a disabled student because of something connected with their disability and cannot justify such treatment.” Discrimination arising from disability will occur if the following three conditions are met:

* You treat a disabled student unfavourably, that is putting them at a substantial disadvantage, even if this was not your intention, and
* This treatment is because of something connected with the disabled student’s disability…, and
* You cannot justify the treatment by showing that is ‘a proportionate means of achieving a legitimate aim.’ [[9]](#footnote-9)

However, if you did not know, nor could be reasonably expected to know of the student’s disability, then this will not amount to unlawful discrimination arising from disability.

Thus it is vital for the education provider to put in place reasonable adjustments for disabled students to avoid putting them at a substantial disadvantage. The duty is anticipatory and corresponding adjustments must also be anticipatory. For example, a university recognises that making an adjustment to provide handouts in advance in electronic format is a common anticipatory need for disabled students, such as those with dyslexia or visual impairments. The university would make this adjustment and agree timescales to ensure that staff make their teaching notes available in this way. (Example provided by Skill: National Bureau for Students with Disabilities).

The level of disadvantage must be *substantial,* that is more than minor or trivial (s.20 Equality Act). Where a provision, criterion or practice places disabled students at a substantial disadvantage, the education institution must take such steps as it is reasonable to take in the circumstances to ensure that the provision, criterion or practice no longer has that effect.

 A competence standard is defined as a standard applied by an education provider for the purpose of determining whether or not a person has a particular level of competence or ability. It is *not* a provision, criterion or practice, so there is no duty to adjust the application of the competence standard. However, there is a duty in relation to the *process* of determining whether a student meets the competence standard. Thus, the mark required to meet a competence standard should not be adjusted, but a disabled person may be given longer in an exam, for example, to be able to demonstrate that he can achieve that standard.

If equipment is needed, or extra staff assistance, the higher education institution must take such steps as it is reasonable for it to take to provide these auxiliary aids to avoid the substantial disadvantage experienced by the disabled student. Students in higher education course may be able to access the Disabled Students Allowance which helps to provide for the cost of study support, for example a laptop computer, note-taker or general dyslexia support.

**Validation and Review**

The QAA Code of Practice reminds institutions that the anticipatory duty identified in the Disability Equality Duty requires them to be able to show that they have taken the entitlements of disabled students into account when designing and reviewing programmes of study. The validation and review processes should “ include an evaluation of the programme aims, teaching and learning methods, intended learning outcomes, and assessment strategies in order to identify potential barriers to the participation of disabled students.” The CoP recommends that the institution seeks to “involve disabled students in the design and review of inclusive provision.”

“The assessment methods to be used on programmes should be sufficiently flexible to enable all students to demonstrate that they have met the learning outcomes, that is, they should allow for appropriate and reasonable adjustments. There may be more than one way of a student demonstrating that they have achieved a particular outcome and these methods should be explored prior to the start of the programme following disclosure by the student of a particular impairment.”

“Staff should be aware of their responsibility to design inclusive programmes and should seek training and ongoing support where necessary. Staff should be given access to sources of advice both from within the institution and externally.”[[10]](#footnote-10)

**Learning and Teaching**

The CoP recommends that staff are made aware “of their anticipatory duty under the DED to provide flexible and inclusive approaches to learning and teaching to ensure that all students, including disabled students, are able to demonstrate that they meet intended learning outcomes and so minimise the need for reasonable adjustments.” However, the CoP does point out that, far from being an onerous duty towards a small minority of students, “ensuring that learning and teaching practices are inclusive of disabled students can enhance the learning opportunities of **all** students.”

It recommends using a range of teaching and learning methods such as group work, seminars, lectures and practical classes, all of which create different challenges for students with different types of learning impairment. Staff should, however, seek to work in partnership with individual students to understand the implications of their impairment in the context of their learning in order to help them adapt their own particular approaches.

Teaching staff have a shared responsibility to support disabled students and should work in partnership with them, and with other bodies such as student services and disability services, to achieve this.

“Clear demarcation of roles and responsibilities helps these partnerships to work effectively. Feedback from students should be used to further adapt methods of teaching and learning. Staff should be given access to sources of advice, both from within the institution and externally, to support their own work in developing inclusive teaching methods.”[[11]](#footnote-11)

**Representation and attainment**

Tutors may be of the opinion that the number of dyslexic students is so small that the extra work involved in catering for their needs will be disproportionate to the advantage gained.

Indeed, according to statistics produced by the Higher Education Statistics Agency in 1996, students with dyslexia constituted just 0.42% of all first year higher education students resident in the UK. Current reports do not show dyslexia as a separate disability, but as a specific learning difficulty (SLD). For the years 2008 – 9, of the 428,260 studying on the first year of an undergraduate programme, 17,620 had an SLD (4.1%).[[12]](#footnote-12)

It has been suggested that up to 10% of the population (or even more) show some signs of dyslexia, particularly when it is present in other members of the family. [[13]](#footnote-13)

This represents approximately **half** of all those known to have a disability. Of all the disabilities, it is the one that should therefore receive the most attention, and yet, while there is no shortage of literature on dyslexia in general, it does not seem to have received the attention it perhaps warrants within higher education teaching and learning.

The National Working Party on Dyslexia in Higher Education suggested that the steady increase in reported dyslexia in higher education was due to three factors:

Earlier identification and provision for schoolchildren with dyslexia;

Increased financial and other support for students with dyslexia in higher education;

Wider access for ‘mature’ students, some of whom may have performed poorly at school because of undetected dyslexia.

One may also add the adoption of more flexible admissions policies by higher education institutions.

However, according to a study by Richardson and Wydell, “dyslexia may have deleterious consequences for progression, completion and achievement in higher education, but it is by no means incompatible with a high level of success, given appropriate commitment on the part of the students and appropriate resources on the part of their institution.”[[14]](#footnote-14) In fact, figures show that 40% of dyslexic students who complete their first degree programmes gain first class or upper second class honours degrees.[[15]](#footnote-15)

**Interviewing the dyslexic student**

## Tutors may wish to discuss the particular needs of the dyslexic student with them informally. On the Skills for Access website one may view videos or download transcripts of interviews with an MA student who has dyslexia; this may give an insight into what to ask, what to look for and the kind of adjustments that may be made.

## Appendix A has some extracts from those transcripts, but some of the key points are highlighted here:

* Note that the students will rely heavily on computers; therefore try to ensure they are able to use a computer during lectures and tutorials as this will help them to record and organise information
* Talk to the students about his or her particular needs – everyone is different and the student will appreciate your interest and willingness to discover how their learning can be enhanced
* Look into getting voice recognition software and see if a quiet room can be made available in campus to enable them to use it effectively
* Build flexibility into your websites or VLE pages to enable different navigation methods, and avoid large quantities of text
* Use visual and oral teaching methods such as videos, vodcasts, diagrams and podcasts to enable the student to use different ways of absorbing materials that may be more helpful than pure text

Appendix B contains the notes of an interview conducted with a law tutor with moderate dyslexia who studied for a law degree as a mature student, having fared badly at school where his dyslexia went undiagnosed. He has since completed two LL.M. degrees and is currently studying for his PhD. He is a shining example of what can be achieved, even in a subject like law, with appropriate support and understanding.

The notes show how the tutor can adopt general teaching and learning strategies such as consistent use of colour in PowerPoint presentations, greater use of flow charts and so on, but also suggests how the student can help himself.

By working together with the dyslexic student and with student support services, the law tutor can make a real difference to the learning experience of that student and to his or her eventual academic success. Having even a basic knowledge of the nature of dyslexia and of the particular needs of the individual student, and by making simple adaptations to teaching and learning methods could make a significant difference to the student with this “bifrent wai ov lerning”.

## APPENDIX A

### Video Transcript 1

“My name's Natasha Campbell and I'm a part time M.A. student in film and I also work for Salford University as well as a project manager. Any written work that I produce, whatever it is, I've got to be able to use a computer to write it down.

I also use it very, very heavily for research, both research in the job and also as a student and that's background research for stuff I need to know about or write about or to do my work and I tend to use the web very heavily to access tutorials, so I'm very IT dependent!

If I try and write by hand it's just awful, 'cause I have two levels of problems: one of them is when I write something down no matter how many times I copy it out I will always make a mistake. I'll always miss out some words or do something wrong with the spelling.

So at a very basic level of writing something out, I just keep on making mistakes, and the great thing about computers is you can just keep on going back until you get it right.

But there's also a second level of problem which is a lot more subtle, and IT's a tremendously powerful tool for dealing with it, and that's to do with how you structure thoughts and that's one of the difficulties I have, 'cause often I can have mass of ideas inside my head but trying to get them out and trying to get them out in a kind of linear structure that flows is very difficult, and the great thing about computers is that you can cut and paste stuff around, you can move it around as many times as you like and you can look at rough drafts, and you can just keep chiselling away at it until it actually says what you want it to say. So it's this tremendously powerful aid

### Video Transcript 2

People think they know what it is. They think it's because you can't spell or you might have difficulty reading. They actually don't understand what the range of the problems are and what some of the underlying issues are and those are the things that often make life the most difficult. You know, it's the organisation thing or the memory thing. So there's a lack of awareness and understanding at that level so it can look like you're just complaining for no reason when you raise these issues.

Be aware it can be a bit of an umbrella term so there's a need to talk to the individual and actually ask them what their particular issues are, and what would help.

### Video Transcript 3

The one thing that I'd really like to be able to use is voice-recognition software...Good voice-recognition software's very powerful but actually having an environment at work or at college where you can use it successfully is often very problematic.

### Video Transcript 5

### (On website design)

In my terms 'poorly designed' would mean it was very badly structured, so it's very difficult to navigate your way around it, find what you wanted on it, and it imposed a big strain on my memory to be able to remember where things were and to be able to remember how to get to different places.

Also, if it was very dense text heavy - like web pages that you visit and there's just screeds of text that you just have to scroll down and they don't even have hyper-links in them so you can easily navigate and move through them.

All of that makes it very difficult. Also, layouts which are non-intuitive and just poorly designed in terms of being very busy and very cluttered, and where different elements on the page are competing for attention so you just get a mass of stuff and it's almost like a visual puzzle rather than something you can clearly see your way around.

One of the things that I find really frustrating is when there's a lack of flexibility in the choices I can make in terms how I navigate round something.

One of the things that people often do, apparently to make something more accessible, is to make the text size really big and I actually find that it creates another problem for me because the thing that I find most beneficial when I first come across something new, is to get a visual overview of it and to have a map to the whole content...

What I'd rather have is a choice and a level of flexibility and if that's not built in for example if I need to make the text size bigger in a particular area to read something then I can do that, but that I can also reduce it back down again. It's the same with kind of colours that are used to have some level of flexibility, the element of choice, 'cause there are some combinations that I find quite difficult and it's things like white text on a black background.

I actually find that quite problematic to read or it's things like if you have some sort of patterned background and you've got text on top of it, again that becomes difficult to read.

### Video Transcript 6

The more of a memory load that's imposed on what I'm doing, the harder it gets for me, so the more tricks I can use to minimise that, the better. I use cutting and pasting a lot, you know, copying stuff from one thing to another.

### Video Transcript 8

Good design is like been given learning wings! It means all the hindrances and all the obstacles are just removed, I can just get on with the job at hand.

Multimedia is a very, very, powerful learning tool and it's certainly my preferred way of learning. It has advantages over oral lectures because I can listen to a lecture, but I can't read my writing afterwards! If I have something that's presented through multimedia formats, all there for me, I can go back to it and it's clear and I can understand it. I can also take my own time and learn at my own pace and again, if its well designed, I can also choose the bits that I want to concentrate on and think that I need to learn about the most rather than having it prescribed for me. A very, very powerful way of learning and it also tends to be better at providing lots of examples so if I'm trying to learn to use a piece of software, to have videos of somebody doing it and showing you what to click on, that's really helpful and again clear pictorial diagrams to back-up the text so I can see what I need to do, all of that is just a huge help over either just purely oral learning or purely traditional text.

### Video Transcript 9

Think about the design as a whole where the aesthetic element is very much in harmony with the information content and the meaning of the piece. Also, do not have design which is really busy in a sense of lots of elements juggling against each other, but make good use of space around different elements. Use a good balance of visual and audio elements again to help that signposting towards meaning and understanding. There are some really good websites out there which do that really well and they're a joy to use.

**Appendix B**

**Interview with GS, a law tutor with dyslexia**

**Q. What are some of the specific issues for someone with dyslexia studying law?**

A. Remembering case names and linking them to facts of the cases. This was a huge problem for me. Teachers spoke of names, not facts.

**Q. What helped you to remember?**

A. A combination of flow charts and pictures around the cases. I did this myself.

**Q. What could teachers have done?**

A. Give the facts of the case each time. Also repetitive association would help it go in.

**Q. Was PowerPoint helpful?**

A. There was no PP at the time, but I don’t think it helps all the time. The slides can be overly detailed or the teacher just reads them verbatim. PP became a problem, not an aid.

Reading figures on the slides can be difficult, depending on the background. The easiest background for me – and each person is different – is to have two colours. Blue and yellow work well.

Letters tend to bend and vibrate. Glasses may help this.

**Q. What about other digital aids?**

A. Videos are helpful in remembering cases. Podcasts are not helpful. Presenters are not always natural; they need to be professional. Some are simply reciting. Video podcasts are no good. Audio podcasts need to be short. I have a short attention span and will tune out if the podcast is too long. A professional one may help as it stimulates the visual memory rather than the auditory memory.

**Q. What are the particular problems with studying law?**

A. Reading statutes. Reading takes longer and I am always re-reading.

With books it’s always good to have a clear structure. It’s easier to start with something like Nutshells and then go on to a more detailed book.

**Q. In an ideal world what could a tutor do to help?**

A. Show a graphic illustration to show law in a logical format, e.g. a flow chart. Explain the whole and then each part of the structure. Need a physical connection between each point. Bit like a computer system – dragging data into a folder.

**Q. How do computers help?**

A.  They do make some difference. It is easier for writing. Ease of finding stuff on the internet; easy to make my own PPs and pictorialise things.

The package “Inspiration” draws mind map diagrams. I need time to use it. The problem with dictation software is that you need time to use it; you have to train the computer by reading set paragraphs, but they are hard to read!

It aids in that you don’t have to rely on your own handwriting. What I write on the screen isn’t always what actually appears.

**Q. What works best for you in exams?**

A. An amanuensis is the best for me. It can cause frustration if you get the wrong person. She needs to be quick as you can lose the thread of what you’re saying.

**Q. Any other advice?**

A. Advise tutors to use colours consistently. All sub-headings should be in one colour, and headings in another. Colour aids memory.

1. <http://www.bdadyslexia.org.uk/about-dyslexia/adults-and-business/what-is-dyslexia.html> Accessed 8/9/10 [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. <http://www.bdadyslexia.org.uk/about-dyslexia/further-information/dyslexia-research-information-.html> Accessed 10.9.10 [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Ibid No.1 [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. McCloughlin, Fitzgibbon and Young; *Adult Dyslexia; Assessment, Counselling and Training;* Whurr Publishers; 1994; London. pp. 19-20 [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Ibid: p.16 [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Ibid p.59 [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Ball, Simon, and Helen James, ‘Making Law Teaching Accessible and Inclusive’, 2009(3) *Journal of Information, Law and Technology (JILT),* <http://go.warwick.ac.uk/jilt/2009_3/ball> Accessed 25.8.10 [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. “What equality means for you as an education provider – further and higher education.” Published by Equality and Human Rights Commission 2010 [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Ibid p.18 [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. QAA Code of Practice for the assurance of academic quality and standards in higher education, Section 3: Disabled Students - March 2010, Section 10 [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Ibid, section 11 [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Table11b, HESA Ltd 2010 – First year UK domiciled HE students by qualification by aim, mode of study, gender and disability 2008/09 [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Pennington B F (1991) Diagnosing Learning Disorders, New York; Guilford [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Richardson, John T.E., Wydell, Taeko N., *The representation and attainment of students with dyslexia in UK higher education;* Reading and Writing: An interdisciplinary Journal; Kluwer Academic publishers, Netherlands 2003. P. 475 [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. HESA Student Record 1995/6 Table 6 [↑](#footnote-ref-15)